

Interactive comment on “Human influence on European winter wind storms such as those of January 2018” by Robert Vautard et al.

Paolo De Luca (Referee)

p.deluca@lboro.ac.uk

Received and published: 20 October 2018

General comments:

The manuscript addresses a very exciting field of research and it does this with two case studies. The motivations are valid and the attribution analysis on storminess over Europe is clear, well defined, robust and significant for many socio-economic aspects. I suggest minor revisions.

Specific comments:

You will find all these comments in the PDF file attached to my review. They mainly concern a few not clear concepts, Figures' design and statistical tests that have not been mentioned in the text.

C1

In particular:

- i) since there are many figures in the text, I suggest to group some of them into one (i.e. 5 to 6 and 10 to 12) so that the number will be reduced and the overall flow kept tighter;
- ii) it is also not clear to me which statistical test you performed for checking the difference between the climate periods (e.g. pag. 8 line 22);
- iii) there is no reference in the text with respect to Table 2 and 3;
- iv) I like the discussion about surface roughness. However it would be nice to have some example in paragraph 6 about what caused the increase in roughness you mentioned;
- v) please also double-check all references.

Technical corrections:

You will find all the technical corrections in the PDF file attached to my review.

I suggest to go directly through the comments in the PDF using the latest version of Adobe Acrobat Reader.

pdf

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://www.earth-syst-dynam-discuss.net/esd-2018-57/esd-2018-57-RC1-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Dynam. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/esd-2018-57>, 2018.

C2