

## Author's Response (H. Kusserow)

**Editor Decision: Publish subject to minor revisions (review by Editor)** (04 Sep 2017) by Tim Brücher  
Comments to the Author:

Dear Author,

thanks for your updated version. As one reviewer asked to put figures on the same color scheme for better comparison I would like to ask you to (i) change the color if possible, or (ii) put a color bar next each figure, so it is easy to see, which color has which meaning - otherwise it is too difficult to compare the images.

A color bar should be attached to all of these figures - although the meaning is explained in the text.

**(i) Color bars/legend were added to Fig. 4, 12, 14-16. Fig. 12 has been redesigned.**

Second: The Figure 7 was asked to be on a vertical structure:

This would enable to have East Africa on the right hand side, West Africa on the left hand side and time running from top to bottom. So it is much more appropriate to put a tick mark on the time axis to the corresponding entry on the Literature.

**(ii) Fig. 8 (not fig. 7) has been completely redesigned according to the editors' recommendation.**

For the structure of the manuscript I would recommend a complete data+method section after introduction, starting with existing data and new (own) data as well as explaining all methods used / developed in this article. This should not be included in the Introduction Section.

It would also help to put the Result-section (discussion) in one chapter with subchapters and close with a Final Conclusion Chapter:

1) Introduction

2) Data & Method

3.1 ... 3.5) Result-Section (If necessary for grouping, you can have 2 chapters (3+4) for the result-section.

last section: Key-Messages ...

**(iii) A complete data+method chapter has been inserted as Sect. 2. The structure of the paper is now:**

**1) Introduction**

**2) Data and Methods**

**3) Desertification, Resilience and Regreening – a general overview**

**4) Desertification, Resilience and Regreening – key factors**

**4.1 The relevance of edaphic factors for a vegetation re-greening**

**4.2 Plant species change**

**4.3 Re-greening Sahel based on NOAA-AVHRR, GIMMS3g, MODIS, SPOT VGT studies**

**4.4 Changes in vegetation pattern, self-organised patchiness**

**5) Key messages and new aspects**

(iv) Listing of changes done in the document:

- Color bars/legend were added to Fig. 4, 12, 14-16, Fig. 12 has been redesigned
- Fig. 8 was completely redesigned, add-on of further authors
- Correction of section numbering
- Information on data and methods in the main text was transferred into Section 2
- Corrections of spelling mistakes in the main text
- Revision of references according to Copernicus Publications Reference Types and add-on of 9 further authors