

Interactive comment on “Migration and global environmental change: methodological lessons from mountain areas of the global South” by A. Milan et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 6 April 2015

The paper aims at advancing current methodologies to study relationships between migration and environmental change. I would suggest that the authors strengthen their review of current methodologies in this body of literature– there are only two small subsections where the authors review surveys and mixed methods and there is no mention of case studies. The authors do not explain why it is problematic that ‘the literature on migration and global environmental change has not yet moved beyond case study results’. There also seems to be a confusion on what is a case study. The authors’ methodology, even if it includes household surveys, is based on three case studies.

As a general comment, I find that the results on household profiles – which is the main
C818

contribution of the paper as the authors mention, come very late. The results and open questions presented earlier are less interesting and do not really serve the purpose of the paper. I would be more interested to understand how the household profiles were built in each case study and why the indicators chosen are pertinent. I also found the case studies lack some historical context, e.g. for how long have people migrated in the villages studied, has there been any change in the forms of migration, etc. Lastly, the authors mention they use SLA but it is not very visible in the paper. I would have liked to know what has been the change in the types of assets before/during/after migration for the different types of households. It is also not clear to me whether income is before/during/after migration. A last comment: Pakistan results suggest that ex ante mobility is the most successful form of mobility - but is it successful because it is ex-ante or because those who were able to move before the shocks were also those who were already less vulnerable?

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Dynam. Discuss., 5, 1711, 2014.