Earth Syst. Dynam. Discuss., 4, C381–C382, 2013
www.earth-syst-dynam-discuss.net/4/C381/2013/
© Author(s) 2013. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.

Earth System Dynamics
Discussions

Interactive comment on "Modelling multiple threats to water security in the Peruvian Amazon using the WaterWorld Policy Support System" *by* A. J. J. van Soesbergen and M. Mulligan

M. Sivapalan (Editor)

sivapala@uiuc.edu

Received and published: 10 August 2013

This is an interesting paper, very well suited to the special issue. The paper has been well served by three excellent reviews who have offered very constructive comments and criticisms of the paper. I expect the paper to be eventually published in ESD, I would like the authors to undertake a major revision of their paper in response to the review comments, and pay attention to the "bigger issues" that the reviewers picked up: (i) why and how the approach that they present is novel, including how they handle the feedbacks between social and biophysical systems, (ii) there is some confusion still in my mind whether they are just presenting a modeling system (they claim not) or an

application of the model (in which case how has the model been validated), and (iii) on the question of groundwater, I would believe the argument that there is presently no groundwater or no groundwater utilization (if this is well substantiated), but if it is indeed part of the water utilization in the region, then it cannot be discounted so easily in terms of water security (in most cases it is a considerable asset to water security, compared to surface water). I like to see these issues thoroughly addressed before the paper goes into HESS. I will seek the advice of the reviewers on a future revised manuscript. I look forward to this in a short while.

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Dynam. Discuss., 4, 567, 2013.