

Interactive comment on “The support of multidimensional approaches in integrate monitoring for SEA: a case of study” by C. M. Torre and M. Selicato

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 24 October 2012

This manuscript describes an innovative and interesting approach to the monitoring phase in Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA), with particular attention to control over time the level of human pressure on land. Particularly interesting is the monitoring system able to provide an automatic alert in case dimension and velocity of land use change overpass some environmental thresholds. Also the use of satellite land use maps and the integration between GIS and multicriteria evaluation (AHP method) is very significant. I think the manuscript could be improved clarifying some points (see below) and I recommend the article to be accepted after the suggested revisions.

Page 1193 lines 16-19: delete the sentences because they refers to the Italian law and

C561

it is not necessary in these general paragraph.

Page 1193 line 21: what is RA?

Page 1193 line 28: not “EIA” but “Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA)”.

Page 1194 line 6: typo, not “planning ,indeed” but “planning, indeed”.

Page 1194 line 21: typo, not “dimension” but “dimensions”.

Page 1194 line 23: it is not clear how this sentence is linked to the previous one (clarify).

Page 1195 line 9-11: the sentence is not clear to me.

Page 1195 line 12: who is the “author”?

Page 1196 line 13: typo, not “ie” but “i.e.”

Page 1196 lines 14-20: maybe the reference to Fischer and Gazzola (2006) is dates; the Italian law of 2006 on SEA has been modified and integrated in 2008 and 2010, so it is necessary to refers to the present framework.

Page 1197 line 13: it could be useful to insert a map of Apulia localization.

Page 1197 line 22: it could be useful to insert a map of the Ambits.

Page 1198 line 19: typo, not “coast,” but “coast;”

Page 1198 line 20: typo, not “recently,” but “recently;”

Page 1198 lines 25-26: better “from an historical and an anthropogenic perspective”

Page 1199 line 9: typo, not “ratings, but “ratings

Page 1199 lines 12-15: the sentences are not very clear; the concept could be better explained.

Page 1200 lines 1-5: define all the terms of the formulas (C as Criticality, S as Sensitivity, $\check{C}(c)$ and then $\check{C}(s)$, $\check{A}(c)$ and $\check{A}(s)$).

C562

Page 1201 line 19: typo, not “area,as” but “areas, as”

Page 1201 line 26: it could be useful to insert a map of Monopoli localization.

Page 1202 line 5: it could be useful to insert a map, indicating Monopoli 1, 2 and 3.

Page 1202 line 6: typo, not 'urban, but urban.

Page 1202 line 16: what is CTR? In addition, are introduced the categories N, U, A, T, P, I which are defined in the next page 1202, lines 5-8; maybe this categories could be defined here or introduced directly in page 1202 (but control also justification line).

Page 1203 line 17: it could be useful insert a map of the shapefile. . Page 1203 line 25: typo, not two commas “area,, beaches”.

Page 1205 line 6: typo, not “Mitigation but “mitigation”.

Page 1205 line 13: typo, not “weigh” but “weight”.

Page 1205 lines 23-25: clarify the sentences describing all the factors of the formulas (X, P, etc.)

Page 1206: after line 14 give some comments about the results of the operation and their usefulness.

Page 1206 line 17: typo, not two commas “Geodata SRL, , we”

Page 1208 line 5: typo, comma instead of full stop (“sensitivity.”)

Page 1208 line 21: typo, not 'analysis, but analysis.

Check some typos in the references.

Figure 1 has not reference into the text.

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Dynam. Discuss., 3, 1191, 2012.