

## ***Interactive comment on “Estimated impact of global population growth on future wilderness extent” by E. Dumont***

**N. de Noblet (Editor)**

nathalie.de-noblet@lsce.ipsl.fr

Received and published: 31 August 2012

Dear Dr. Dumont

I am now in possession of 2 reviews of your paper and of 1 posted comment. We must both admit that all comments are very critical and both reviewers do suggest rejection of your paper. Based on those and on my own reading of it I have to follow the recommendations made and suggest you undergo a full re-writing of your paper and eventual re-submission afterwards. In its present state your paper cannot be accepted. It ignores many essential land dynamic processes: technological innovations, changes in consumption patterns, trade in food and wood products, land institutions... It seems to have adopted a very narrow perspective (birth rates) to the point of being almost irrelevant. You're not making use of the abundant literature that has been published so

C319

far. You are of course fully entitled to suggest that previous approaches may not be relevant, or insufficient, but you have to demonstrate that yours is indeed a potentially novel and skillful one which is not what you do.

I hope you'll still find the comments useful to move forward and make a clearer demonstration that your hypothesis are valid. I also hope you'll still be up to submit in ESD.

Best regards - Nathalie

---

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Dynam. Discuss., 3, 433, 2012.